[Writer Name]

[Institute Name]

[Date]

Critical Analysis of "The Effects of Personality, Affectivity, and Work Commitment on Motivation to Improve Work through Learning"

<u>INTRODUCTION</u>

The introduction of a dissertation should clarify to the reader what the researcher is going to explore. It should explain the research topic and its scope as well. The researcher should describe the aims and objectives for exploring the chosen research area by referring to the appropriate literature. Having completed the work on the dissertation's main substance, the researcher should have a much clearer idea of its nature and scope than the researcher did when he or she wrote the opening abstract. (Salkind)

However, introduction part of the article written by Naquin and Holton explain the aims and purpose of the study related to "*to which the dimensions from the Five-FactorModel of personality, affectivity, and work commitment (including workethic, job involvement, affective commitment, and continuance commitment)influenced motivation to improve work through learning*", but this part did not mention any the sample size (population or participants). Moreover, this part also did not mention clear hypothesis of the study. The hypothesis is the prediction statement in a study based on the theory that a researcher is researching.

<u>PROBLEM STATEMENT</u>

As far as the problem statement of this study, the researchers defined well it. According to researchers, in past a very few studies has been done to examine dispositional characteristics in the context of organisationalHRD. There seem to be limited empirical researches linking motivation in the contexts of learning with personality and other individual traits. According

to them, there is no any model that explains dispositional impacts on motivation of an employee to enhance work through learning.

## HYPOTHESIS

In this study, Naquin and Holton did not clearly define the hypothesis of the study. However, they discussed hypothesis at various places in the study. For example, they mentioned that the causal relationships as hypothesis were examined in the study through structural equation modeling.However, hypothesis should be expressed in a declarative form. It is a basic assumption which is based on reasoning. Hypothesis supports the study in finding and answering to a problem(Casse, Lauridsen and Nordhaug: p. 93). The hypotheses of this study could be, for example, "cconscientiousnesswill be positively related to continuance commitment", "extraversion will be positively related to affective commitment", etc.

## NEED FOR STUDY

The study to explore dispositional characteristics in the context of organisational HRDis clearly in its investigative stages. For that reason, the causal models as well as the hypotheticalbases strongly need more work. Moreover, in this study the modifications of modelwill obviously needmeasuring the predictive performance of a statistical model through cross-validation.

## METHODOLOGY

After defining the sample size in the methodology section, Naquin and Holton (2002) defined the procedure how to collect data. They used survey method and conducted training programmes. All the subjects were required to attend these programmes and questionnaires were administered as part of the programme. However, researchers did not give any evidence of survey and questionnaire that validate the research.

The researcher used the non-random sampling method that has both advantages and disadvantages. It is more accurate as the researcher is targeting a specific group or population. For that reason, the answers will be same to what the rest of the participants will respond. (Ardilly and Tillé: p. 33) On the disadvantage side, non-random sampling technique is more biased, as the individuals preferred are not at random. They also might not reflect what another population thinks.(Ardilly and Tillé: p. 33)

The researchers used structural equation modeling as instrument with LISREL8.3 to examine the causal relationships betweenvariables in the hypothesised model.Structural equation models are mathematical relationships reflecting the structure or hypothesised relationships among variables. It is an "a priori" method wherein theory leads the model's development and specification, contrasted with mining the data to create a model (Kline: p. 15-33). Despite its advantages, this technique also has some limitations. The most obvious limitation is that this technique adopted at the beginning constructing models to fit the sample COVARIANCE rather than the sample values themselves(Kline: p. 15-33). According to Kline (p. 15-33), such an idea has ruined the valuable data. Another disadvantage is its statistical complexity. Even the simplest SEMs will comprise tens of parameters, as several parameter matrices are there in a SEM. Computational complication is the direct effect it brings.

## RESULT, DISCUSSION, LIMITATION, AND POTENTIAL FOR THE FUTURE RESEARCH

In the result section, Naquin and Holton presented the results they obtained through the measurement model analysis and structural model analysis. In the measurement model analysis, they first examined examine the loadings of instrument items on each scale excluding the NEO-FFI and the PANAS. However, they did not give detail thoroughly this phase. However, they carefully measured the loading of the scales on the designated

latentconstructs. They thoroughly presented the results they obtained from the structural model analysis.

In the discussion part, the researchers carefully discussed all the aspects which include motivation toimprove work through learning (MTIWL), the significance of the path from PA to MTIWL that supports previous research, and the entire five-factor model.

Like all research studies, there are limitations to this study as well. The researchers clearly mentioned the limitations of their study. According to them, as the research study is based on self-report data and the surveys were conducted at the beginning of in-house training programmes, the possibility is there about common method variance. However, it is not a major issue. The researchers expressed another limitation that data came from a non-random sampling technique, and for that reason this technique limited the generalizability of the major findings (Ardilly and Tillé: p. 33). Subjects of the study worked for a single firm where representation of female employees was high than male employees.

However, in the last few years, the most fascinating research has been targeted learner dispositional impacts on learning, principally through motivation to learn. Dispositional impacts are a general grouping of individual characteristics that are comparatively steady and enduring and that incline an individual toward specific patterns. Personality among many others is the well-known example of dispositional traits.

There are many research studies, including(Whiteside and Lynam: p. 689; Judge and Bono: p. 751), found another of the Five-Factor Model of personality dimensions as openness to experience, is associated with learning and transfer outcomes. However, the study of Naquin and Holton (2002) did not explore and find a considerable effect for this construct. Openness to experience is related to intellect, curiosity regarding one's environment, and an inclination to discover new things. As training requires individuals to grip new and innovative things,

this characteristic should be valuable and useful to learners (George and Zhou: p. 513).

However, they found support in their study for agreeableness as a predictor, but most of the

researchers have not. In fact, agreeableness is an important interactive characteristic that

shows the level to which an individual is usually a cooperative, sympathetic, and trusting one

in interactive situations. Only limited assistance has been determined, may be because its

consequence is limited to training associated with training to build interpersonal skills.

Despite Five-Factor Model of personality dimensions, the newest trait to find has been goal

orientation, which posits that people are of two types, learning oriented versus performance

oriented(Payne, Youngcourt and Beaubien; p. 128).

So, goal orientation and openness to experience are the major factors that is lacking in this

study. These two major factors need to be explored in the future. Although a better

understanding of dispositional influences on workplace learning would allow

learningprofessionals to modify training interventions in a more effective manner and

enhance performance through learning as well. But, goal orientation and openness to

experience are the two major factors and potential subject for the future research workers.

ARTICLE CRITIQUE

There are some limitations in this study conducted by Naquin and Holton. As discussed

above, the introduction of the study is not very good as in did not provide sufficient

understanding regarding the research question and overall methodology used in the study.

There are no any hypotheses in this study. Hypothesis supports the study in finding and

answering to a problem and also gives reader a better understanding of the research topic.

However, the researchers defined the problem statement carefully in the study. The problem

statement assists the research worker as he or she starts the project. It does more than a few

things: it enables the research worker to investigate more deeply into the research area, assists

narrow the work focus to the most pertinent information only, develops the thesis statement, and saves considerable amount of time during the research process.

In their study, Naquin and Holton (2002) usedsurvey method and conducted training programmes where they administered a set of questionnaire to collect data. However, researchers should give the evidence of survey and questionnaire in their study as they validate the research study. Moreover, non-random sampling method was used in the study that some disadvantages. This method is more biased and the reason is that the individuals preferred are not at random. They also might not reflect what another population thinks. They should use random sampling method to collect data. As this method is done at random, the entire process is unbiased. Of course it does not 100% protect from bias (depending on the question). However, this option is a quicker approach to collect most authentic data. Random sampling method would be best as it considers the entire population and get the results of the whole population.

The researchers also used the structural equation modeling as instrument with LISREL 8.3 in their study.Two of the most obvious disadvantages of this model are that this is a statistical complexity model and adopted at the beginning constructing models to fit the sample COVARIANCE rather than the sample values themselves.

However, overall result that the researcher obtained, analysis of the findings, and discussion are good. On good thing in their article is that Naquin and Holton (2002)mentioned the limitations and scope of the study well. Limitation and Scope of the study states the coverage and level of the study as well as its weaknesses and strengths.

SUMMARY & CONCLUSION

The limited research on job attitudes has concentrated on many variables.One is job involvement, and the other one is organisational pledge. Naquin andHolton (2002) provide a

convincing evidence of the worth of these variables in their research of the impacts of dispositional variables and work attitudes on a construct they addressed and found as Motivation to Improve Work through Learning (MTIWL).

Despite some of the negative points in the study and some limitations, overall study is good that will be supportive for learningprofessionals in understanding of the dispositional impacts on employee motivation to tailor training interventions successfully.

# Works Cited

Ardilly, Pascal, and Yves Tillé. *Sampling Methods*. 1st ed. New York: Springer, 2006. Print.

Casse, Thorkil, Laurids S Lauridsen, and Kristen Nordhaug. 'Hypotheses For Research'. *Global Challenges-Local Responses: An Institutional Perspective on Economic Transformation in Asia* 25 (2006): 93. Print.

George, Jennifer M, and Jing Zhou. 'When Openness To Experience And Conscientiousness Are Related To Creative Behavior: An Interactional Approach.'. *Journal of Applied Psychology* 86.3 (2001): 513. Print.

Judge, Timothy A, and Joyce E Bono. 'Five-Factor Model Of Personality And Transformational Leadership.'. *Journal of applied psychology* 85.5 (2000): 751. Print.

Kline, Rex B. *Principles And Practice Of Structural Equation Modeling*. 1st ed. New York: Guilford Press, 2005. Print.

Payne, Stephanie C, Satoris S Youngcourt, and J Matthew Beaubien. 'A Meta-Analytic Examination Of The Goal Orientation Nomological Net.'. *Journal of Applied Psychology* 92.1 (2007): 128. Print.

Salkind, Neil J. *Exploring Research*. 1st ed. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 2000. Print.

Whiteside, Stephen P, and Donald R Lynam. 'The Five Factor Model And Impulsivity: Using A Structural Model Of Personality To Understand Impulsivity'. *Personality and individual differences* 30.4 (2001): 669--689. Print.